

**MEETING MINUTES of the
TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE (TAC)
North Front Range Transportation and Air Quality Planning Council**

**Windsor Recreation Center - Pine Room
250 North 11th Street
Windsor, CO**

**August 15, 2018
1:01 – 3:25 p.m.**

TAC MEMBERS PRESENT:

Dave Klockeman, Chair – Loveland
Will Jones, Vice Chair – Greeley
Dawn Anderson – Weld County
Stephanie Brothers – Berthoud
Aaron Bustow – FHWA
Kelley Grubbs - RAQC
Mitch Nelson – Severance
Rusty McDaniel – Larimer County
Karen Schneiders – CDOT
Dennis Wagner – Windsor
Kailey Zeisel – Transfort/Fort Collins alternate

TAC MEMBERS ABSENT:

Amanda Brimmer – RAQC
Gary Carsten – Eaton
Rick Coffin – CDPHE-APCD
John Franklin – Johnstown
Eric Fuhrman – Timnath
Wendy Heywood – LaSalle
Tim Kemp – Fort Collins
Katy Mason – LCOA
Fred Starr – Evans
Ranae Tunison – FTA
Town of Milliken

NFRMPO STAFF:

Ryan Dusil
Alex Gordon
Becky Karasko
Medora Kealy
Suzette Mallette

IN ATTENDANCE:

Allison Baxter – Greeley
Marissa Gaughan – CDOT
Alana Koenig – CDOT
Katrina Kloberdanz – CDOT
Ulysses Torres - GET

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Klockeman called the meeting to order at 1:01 p.m.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There was no public comment.

APPROVAL OF THE JULY 18, 2018 TAC MINUTES

Karasko stated Brimmer submitted a change to the July RAQC report. Anderson moved to approve the June 20, 2018 TAC minutes as amended. The motion was seconded by Jones and approved unanimously.

CONSENT AGENDA

Target Setting for PM2 (Pavement and Bridge Condition Measures) and PM3 (Performance of NHS, Freight, and CMAQ Measures) Targets – Jones asked if Gordon will be adding asterisks denoting clarification of the definitions for some performance measures, as discussed at the July 18, 2018 TAC meeting. Gordon stated he added the clarification in the August Planning Council packet. McDaniel moved to recommend Planning Council set targets by supporting the adoption of the Statewide targets for PM2 and PM3. The motion was seconded by Wagner and approved unanimously.

DISCUSSION

2018 Call for Projects Process – Kealy stated TAC discussed the 2018 Call for Projects at the June and July TAC meetings. The Draft Guidebook for the 2018 Call for Projects was included in the TAC packet and identified eligible entities, eligible project types, project requirements, and scoring criteria for each funding program. The Guidebook carries forward most of the policies from the 2016 Call for Projects with a few changes.

Kealy stated CMAQ emissions formulas are not included in the Guidebook. CDOT is currently working with entities who distribute CMAQ funds to identify recommended toolkits. The entities hope to meet again in the next month and Kealy will bring an update to the September 19, 2018 TAC meeting.

Anderson asked if the CMAQ formulas will be brought back as a Discussion Item. Kealy stated it will come back as an Action Item so the Call can open in October.

Kealy stated the EPA's Diesel Emissions Quantifier (DEQ) tool will not be considered moving forward as it is not well regarded for evaluating alternative fuel vehicle project estimations because it does not have CNG-specific factors.

Kealy outlined the schedule provided in the TAC packet. Projects touching a state highway must submit a 1-2 page mini-application form to Schneiders by October 31, 2018. The form will be provided by NFRMPO and will request a basic description of project scope, budget, and timeline. Schneiders stated this requirement helps CDOT determine if there are opportunities to partner with local agencies, make projects more efficient, ensure they are consistent with State plans, and allow time for sponsors to reconcile issues before the application is due to the NFRMPO. Kealy added project sponsors can submit any project to CDOT if they wish, but it is only required if the project touches a state highway.

Kealy stated the 2018 Call for Projects Application due date is delayed slightly to allow time for Planning Council to approve the process and create a window for project sponsors whose project submissions may hinge on the outcome of ballot initiatives related to transportation funding.

Schneiders asked if there will be experts on environmental mitigation and historic/scenic transportation at the December NoCo Bike & Ped Collaborative meeting. Kealy stated NoCo Bike & Ped will only score the bike/ped-related projects and any projects from the other Transportation Alternatives (TA) project categories will be scored by the committee formed of TAC members.

Kealy stated the proposed Planning Council approval on February 7, 2019 would allow for air quality conformity and TIP adoption in the spring. Karasko added project sponsors will make a short, informal presentation to the Planning Council at the January 3, 2019 meeting, as has been done in previous Calls. Mallette asked if it is still a useful exercise. Anderson stated it is worthwhile. Jones agreed, adding it helps Planning Council members see the breadth of projects happening across the region.

Anderson asked if the NoCo Bike & Ped Collaborative will present their recommendation at the December 19, 2018 TAC meeting. Kealy responded they will.

Kealy stated she will send an email soon to select a date for the CMAQ and STBG project scoring meeting.

Klockeman suggested the STBG Community Targets page of the TAC packet be highlighted for Planning Council when they discuss the process at their October 4, 2018 meeting. Kealy stated the formula and process is unchanged from the 2016 Call, but population estimates have been updated to 2016 figures. Mallette explained the purpose of the additional allowable request allows the next best unfunded project to be funded if awarded funds are returned for any reason.

Klockeman suggested the Additional Allowable Request column be removed when presented to Planning Council to simplify the table. Kealy stated she will make this change.

Kealy explained another change to the process is requiring all CMAQ and STBG projects to demonstrate contribution toward achievement of a federally required performance measure, and adding a scoring criterion for "Contribution to Target Achievement." Mallette asked to what extent project

sponsors need to demonstrate achievement to the targets. Kealy stated it is up to the project sponsor to provide adequate data to demonstrate how their project contributes to the targets. Gaughan asked if the "Contribution to Target Achievement" criterion creates double counting with the Emissions Benefit criteria. Kealy stated the new criterion allows project sponsors to demonstrate benefits beyond emissions, such as congestion or multimodal, not captured by the emissions criteria. Bustow suggested the wording be changed to make clear the criterion applies to more than just one target. Kealy noted the federally required measures have different coverage areas, such as the National Highway System (NHS) or all public roads, and are identified in the Guidebook.

Mallette requested TAC members review the criteria weighting for STBG. Jones suggested the possible points for safety for small communities be increased to 30 to match the large community value. To balance this increase, five points will be taken away from system preservation.

Mallette stated economic development is a new criterion for STBG. Schneiders suggested it will be difficult to objectively score a project based on economic development impacts. Kealy stated it can be a qualitative measure. Schneiders stated the other criteria lend themselves better to quantitative analysis. Kealy stated she will make clear in the STBG form the economic development criterion is narrative and qualitative.

Kealy stated CMAQ projects requiring issuance of a Buy America Waiver will be prohibited. Schneiders stated this requirement should be expanded to all federal-aid projects. Bustow clarified it should be for vehicle waivers, specifically. Kealy stated she would change the language and add this requirement to all funding programs.

Schneiders stated ITS projects must comply with or support the regional ITS Architecture. Jones asked if this applies only to projects touching state highways. Kloberdanz stated it is anything CDOT would be expected to maintain and anything tying into their system. Kealy stated she thought all ITS projects had to comply with the architecture, even if they are not on state facilities. Gaughan stated Bob Fifer with CDOT Transportation Systems Management & Operations (TSM&O) may be a good person to speak with. Karasko stated she would talk with him. Bustow added all ITS projects with federal-aid must have Systems Engineering Analysis (SEA) performed.

Kealy stated the NoCo Bike & Ped Collaborative reviewed the criteria used in the 2016 Call for Projects and may be revising the weighting, which will be brought to the September TAC meeting. Mallette asked how non-bike/ped TA applications will be scored. Kealy stated those have not been set up. Mallette suggested the section title be changed to specify these requirements only apply to bike/ped TA applications. Gaughan stated CDOT has scoring criteria for the three different TA project categories which could be serve as a template for environmental mitigation or historic/scenic transportation activities projects. Kealy stated she will note this in the guidebook.

Kealy stated the eligible roadways are the federal-aid eligible portions of the 2040 Regionally Significant Corridors (RSCs). Kealy stated reclassification of non-federal-aid eligible roadways will likely not happen in time for this Call. Karasko added the reclassification will happen in time for the adoption of the *2045 Regional Transportation Plan (RTP)*.

Kealy stated at the last TAC meeting RAQC requested a set-aside of STBG funds for ozone air quality modeling. RAQC currently receives \$600,000 from DRCOG over four years and is requesting \$50,000 to \$100,000 over two years from the NFRMPO. The funding would be used for State Implementation Plan (SIP) modeling and ozone sensitivity analysis. Kealy stated the difference in funding between DRCOG and NFRMPO considers the difference in size between the two regions. Kealy stated this request will go to Planning Council as a Discussion Item at their September 6, 2018 meeting. Mallette suggested TAC members discuss this with the Planning Council members ahead of that meeting. Grubbs stated the North Front Range emissions are 15 percent of the total inventory and \$100,000 is 14 percent of the need for modeling platform, coming out to \$25,000 a year for four years. Mallette suggested the funding be approved for four years, then reevaluated.

Kealy asked if the STBG criteria and requirements adequately supported any potential I-25 application. TAC members agreed that they did.

Mallette asked whether, with such limited TA funds (\$330,816 a year), the NoCo Bike & Ped Collaborative should submit applications for their top-priority projects rather than having individual agencies submit several applications. Dusil stated the requirement for bike/ped projects to be on one of twelve Regional Non-Motorized Corridors (RNMCS) may limit the number of applications submitted. Mallette stated the reason for only one TA project application in 2016 may have been due to confusion over who was charged with submitting the project. Kealy stated leaving the application to local agencies ensures a competitive process.

FY2018-FY2019 UPWP Amendment #3 – Karasko explained Task 2.11 was updated and Task 4.5 was added for FY2019 in the *FY2018-FY2019 UPWP*. For Task 2.11, funding would be carried forward from FY2018 to FY2019. The project is on Harmony Road/WCR74 and is being led by the Town of Severance. Task 4.5 is a new project funded through an FTA §5304 grant, a National Aging and Disability Transportation Center (NADTC) grant, and a local match from Larimer County. The partners working on this project will include Larimer County, the NFRMPO, and the Partnership for Age-Friendly Communities (PAFC). The Finance Committee will review the FY2019 Budget Amendment on September 20, 2018 and it will go to Planning Council for approval at their October 4, 2018 meeting.

North Front Range Regional Rail Concept – Karasko stated Randy Grauberger of WSP presented to TAC on the North Front Range Regional Rail Concept along the Great Western Rail Corridor between Greeley and Fort Collins at the June 20 TAC meeting. Communities along the corridor held a meeting in June to discuss the project and next steps. Jones stated Planning Council members Horak and Casseday have shown interest in the concept. Karasko stated the regional rail concept is in the fiscally-unconstrained scenario for the *2045 RTE*. Mallette asked who would lead the charge. Jones stated he envisions the NFRMPO initiating a feasibility study and demand analysis study.

Jones recommended TAC members and NFRMPO staff work together on a presentation for the October 4, 2018 Planning Council meeting. The presentation will highlight potential roles, funding mechanisms, and next steps for a rail study. Jones stated the initial estimate for a study was between \$300,000 and \$500,000. Karasko stated some components could be handled in-house. Mallette asked whether the study will be community-driven rather than developer-driven. Jones stated the developers helped initiate the conversation, but the communities will be pursuing the study.

McDaniel asked where the money would come from for the study. Klockeman suggested bringing information to the Planning Council. Jones stated he would be willing to present on behalf of TAC with help from NFRMPO staff. Schneiders recommended Commissioner Gilliland be involved in the presentation as well. Mallette suggested presenting funding options in the presentation. Jones stated he would like to bring the presentation to TAC first to ensure it represents the group's interests. Jones and NFRMPO staff will bring a presentation to the September 19, 2018 TAC meeting for review, then present at the October 4, 2018 Planning Council meeting.

2045 Goals, Objectives, Performance Measures, and Targets (GOPMT) – Gordon presented a revised GOPMT framework with recommendations from the July 18, 2018 TAC meeting incorporated. Martin and Gordon consolidated the Transportation Demand Management (TDM) and Intelligent Transportation Systems (ITS) into one objective called "Optimize the transportation system." The *2045 RTP* Policies were also removed from the framework, to be developed separately at a later date. Safety performance measure targets were approved by Planning Council in February and Gordon presented to Planning Council on bridge condition, pavement condition, congestion, and air quality performance measure targets at their August 2, 2018 meeting. Planning Council asked whether reliability is the best way to measure congestion.

Gordon asked for feedback from TAC on the MPO-specific performance measures and targets. Gordon stated the population living within paratransit and demand response service area was at 63 percent at the 2016 benchmark, with a target of 75 percent in 2045. Gordon stated the target was originally set at 85 percent, but was lowered after consulting with the transit agencies. Jones asked how private

services can be measured. Zeisel suggested looking solely at public providers for ease of data monitoring.

Dusil stated the benchmark for non-motorized facility miles, including trails, shared-use paths, bike lanes, and sidewalks is at 3,352 miles based on the NFRMPO's 2016 GIS inventory. The 2045 target is set at 5,016 miles, assuming the build out of all RNMCs, build out of most other trails/shared-use paths, addition of bike lanes based on community road design standards, and additional sidewalks based on an assumption that all new local and major roads will be constructed with sidewalks. The target represents a 50 percent increase in the 2016 non-motorized facilities. Dusil stated he presented this target to the NoCo Bike & Ped Collaborative at their August 8, 2018 meeting and they found it to be appropriate.

Dusil stated the NFRMPO will be required to set a target for non-single-occupancy-vehicle (SOV) travel in 2022, so NFRMPO staff is proposing a performance measure related to the percent of commute trips made via a non-SOV mode. Non-SOV modes include carpooling, public transportation, taxicab, motorcycle, bicycle, walk, work at home/telecommute, and other. The 2016 benchmark of 23.1 percent is based on 2011 – 2016 American Community Survey (ACS) 5-Year estimates of journey to work responses. Dusil stated although the trend is relatively flat, most other MPOs with a target for this performance measure aim for a five to 10 percentage point increase from the baseline benchmark by the plan's horizon year. This would put the NFRMPO between a 28 percent and 33 percent non-SOV mode share in 2045. The NoCo Bike & Ped Collaborative also reviewed this target and asked for a target higher than 33 percent. Dusil asked whether TAC would like to adopt this performance measure and target now and, if so, what methods and data sources they would like to consider. Bustow asked to see how the percentages translate to number of commuters. Dusil stated the calculations were made using DOLA estimates and projections, as well as ACS estimates of workforce-age population. Klockeman stated Larimer County's population is aging, which may be problematic for a more ambitious target. Dusil stated Weld County's population is getting younger, but did not look to see how these trends between counties would offset one another in the projections. Mallette added the mode shares are quite different between communities in the region.

Klockeman stated it is hard to envision a 33 percent non-SOV mode share, as it is almost a 50 percent increase from today. McDaniel stated 30 percent may also be too high. Brothers suggested 25 percent. Gordon stated in 2022 the target will be reevaluated and set over a four-year period. Mallette added the reporting is done in one-year increments. Wagner supported a target of 25 percent and TAC concurred.

Gordon stated the benchmark for fixed-route revenue hours per capita within service areas is set at 0.65 based on 2016 National Transit Database (NTD) reports. Gordon explained this is a measure of how many hours the service is operating along routes with designated stops per capita and is a measure of the service provided, not how well it is used. Torres and Zeisel stated the target is reasonable. Gordon added services like the Poudre Express and other efforts will help achieve this target.

Gordon stated Daily Vehicle Miles Traveled (VMT) per capita is calculated as Daily VMT divided by the 2016 DOLA population and the target is to stay at or below the 2016 benchmark of 24. TAC members agreed on the target.

Gordon stated the Travel Time Index (TTI) measures how peak period speeds compare to free flow speeds on RSCs, on average. The benchmark for the percent of peak period speeds on RSCs under 1.5 times the free flow speed, on average, is 90 percent for 2017, according to INRIX data. The target is to maintain this to 2045, meaning a 10-minute drive in free flow conditions would not take more than 15 minutes during the peak period, on average.

Gordon stated NFRMPO staff is proposing two new performance measures to address national goals. The first is on project delivery. Schneiders stated there are three options for measuring project delivery: 1) the date the project is accepted by the local agency from the contractor, 2) the FHWA end date after which there is no more federal-aid reimbursement, or 3) closure date by which all paperwork is complete

and CDOT shuts it down in their system. CDOT staff and NFRMPO staff will work together to refine the measure.

Gordon stated NFRMPO staff is waiting on data from CDOT to see what percent of the National Highway System (NHS) is covered by ITS. Klockeman asked how ITS is defined. Schneiders stated there could be many interpretations. Gaughan suggested a presentation to TAC from Bob Fifer on how CDOT views ITS. NFRMPO staff will revisit how to define this and report back to TAC.

2045 Regionally Significant Corridors (RSCs) – Kealy requested communities notify NFRMPO staff of the roadways they will be requesting reclassifications of from CDOT by September 5, 2018. Greeley, Weld County, and Loveland will potentially be submitting reclassifications. The 2045 RSCs will return to TAC as an Action Item prior to March 2019 to allow the completion of the *2019 Congestion Management Process (CMP)* in spring 2019 and, if possible, after the reclassification process is complete.

2045 Regional Transportation Plan (RTP) Process and Schedule – Karasko highlighted the anticipated completion dates for components of the *2045 RTP*, stating TAC involvement will vary by component, but only final drafts will be brought to TAC for review, whereas all chapter drafts were brought to TAC for review for the *2040 RTP*. Karasko asked to what extent TAC wants to be involved with individual components. Klockeman asked how the content of the *2045 RTP* will compare to that of the *2040 RTP*. Karasko stated it will be structurally similar with additions and changes required by the FAST Act, three additional chapters, and changes based on feedback received during the last FHWA certification review. Klockeman stated it would be helpful to have major changes from the *2040 RTP* highlighted along the way for TAC and Anderson agreed.

OUTSIDE PARTNERS REPORTS

NoCo Bike & Ped Collaborative – A written report was provided.

Regional Transit Agencies – Zeisel thanked CDOT and NFRMPO for providing letters of support for Transfort's application for the FTA's FY2018 Bus and Bus Facilities Discretionary Program, funding "Accessible Infrastructure Enhancement Project."

Schneiders reported Bustang to Broncos games has begun. Brothers asked where it stops. Schneiders responded the Downtown Transit Center and Harmony Transfer Center in Fort Collins, and the US34 Park-n-Ride in Loveland.

Klockeman stated Loveland has a conference call with Jeff Sanders of CDOT's Division of Transit and Rail (DTR) to discuss upcoming grant opportunities.

Senior Transportation – Gordon stated a Bustang travel training is scheduled for October 4, 2018. Gordon stated coordination for the travel training is underway with Transfort, COLT, Berthoud Mayor Will Karspeck, the Rocky Mountain Student Media, and Partnership for Age-Friendly Communities (PAFC).

Regional Air Quality Council – Grubbs stated new RAQC Director, Mike Silverstein, will begin at the end of August. Funding is available for the Commercial Lawn and Garden Equipment Program through the end of 2018. The Alt Fuels Colorado Grant Request for Applications will remain open until September 27, 2018. The Denver-North Front Range 8-hour Ozone Nonattainment Area will not reach attainment this year.

REPORTS

Transportation Ballot Initiatives Update – Klockeman stated both statewide initiatives got enough petition signatures to go on the November ballot, pending verification. Mallette stated Sandra Solin with the Northern Colorado Legislative Alliance (NCLA) will be presenting the pros and cons of each initiative at the September 6, 2018 Planning Council meeting. Mallette added CDOT has developed fact sheets on the funding scenarios.

ROUNDTABLE

Karasko stated the next Model Steering Team (MST) meeting will be August 29, 2018 in the NFRMPO office. The MST will be reviewing land use model outputs.

Kloberdanz stated CDOT is soliciting intersections from cities, counties, and the NFRMPO by Friday, August 17 for evaluation in an intersection prioritization study.

Gaughan stated Betsy Jacobsen recently sent information to Karasko and Mallette on an America Walks grant opportunity for medium-sized cities to help with the development and implementation of pedestrian safety plans.

Kealy stated she will be sending an email soon on the project delay review process and it will be discussed at the September 19, 2018 TAC meeting.

Gordon stated he and Martin will be sending a draft of the *2045 Regional Transit Element (RTE)* out by the end of the week and would like TAC to review it by September 3, 2018.

Wagner stated Harmony Road east of WCR13 will be closed for up to nine days so the developer can widen the first half mile.

Mallette stated the Planning Council will be discussing at their September 6, 2018 meeting their local priorities for the 40 percent of the funding from Initiative 153, the Metro Mayors' Sales Tax, to be set aside for local governments. TAC members should expect questions from Planning Council members ahead of that meeting.

Anderson stated Weld County has a new Transportation Planner starting August 16.

Klockeman stated Loveland received seven proposals for the update of their 2012 Transportation Plan, 2012 Bicycle and Pedestrian Plan, and 2009 Transit Plan. Updating these plans will likely take 15-16 months.

MEETING WRAP-UP

Final Public Comment – There was no final public comment.

Next Month's Agenda Topic Suggestions – Consent Items will include the FY2018 – FY2019 UPWP Amendment #3 and the 2045 GOPMT; Action Items will include the September TIP Amendment and the 2018 Call for Projects Process; Presentations will include Clean Cities from Sheble McConnellogue and Regional Ozone Planning and Outreach from Amanda Brimmer and Sarah Goodwin; and Discussion Items will include the Regional Rail Concept, the *2045 Regional Transit Element (RTE)*, the Delayed FY2018 TIP Projects Review, and the Non-Motorized Project List for the *2019 Statewide Bicycle Plan*.

Meeting adjourned at 3:25 p.m.

Meeting minutes submitted by:

Ryan Dusil, NFRMPO Staff

The next meeting will be held at 1:00 p.m. on Wednesday, September 19, 2018 at the Windsor Recreation Center, Pine Room.